#### %JS 44 (Rev. 12/07)

### case 13 cv-07614-RB Document 1 Filed 12/30/10 Page 1 of 16 CIVIL COVER SHEET

Page/1) at 16 - 70/4

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating

the civil docket sheet. (SEE I	NSTRUCTIONS ON THE REVERSE OF THE FORM.)	4	0 7614
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS		DEFENDANTS <b>L</b>	
APPALA(	CHIAN INSURANCE COMPANY,	INSURANCE COMPANY OF	
	e of First Listed Plaintiff Providence, RI EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)		ndapt Philadelphia, PA  IF CASES ONLY)  CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE
(c) Attorney's (Firm Nam	e, Address, and Telephone Number)	Attorneys (If Known)	
Christie, Pabarue, Mo	ortensen and Young, A Professional Boulevard, 10th Floor, Phila. PA 1910:	3 215	
		III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PA	ARTIES(Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff
☐ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	3 Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)		and One Box for Defendant)  PTF  POPT  POP
2 U.S. Government Defendant	Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)	of	porated and Principal Place Business In Another State
		Citizen or Subject of a 3 3 Foreign Foreign Country	gn Nation 0 6 0 6
NATURE OF SUI	T (Place an "X" in One Box Only)  TORTS	FORFEITURE/PENALTY BANKRUP	TCY OTHER STATUTES
10 Insurance   20 Marine   130 Miller Act   140 Negotiable Instrument   150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgmen   151 Medicare Act   152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excl. Veterans)   153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits   150 Other Contract   195 Contract Product Liability   196 Franchise   REAL PROPERTY   210 Land Condemnation   220 Foreclosure   230 Rent Lease & Ejectment   245 Tort Product Liability   290 All Other Real Property	Slander 368 Asbestos Persona Injury Product Liability Liability PERSONAL PROPER 345 Marine Product Liability 371 Truth in Lending 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability 255 Motor Vehicle Product Liability 385 Property Damage Property Damage 385 Property Damage 385 Property Damage		410 Antitrust   430 Banks and Banking   450 Commerce   460 Deportation   470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations   480 Consumer Credit   490 Cable/Sat TV   810 Selective Service   850 Securities/Commodities/Exchange   875 Customer Challenge   12 USC 3410   890 Other Statutory Actions   891 Agricultural Acts   892 Economic Stabilization Act   894 Energy Allocation Act   895 Freedom of Information   895 Freedom of Information
🔀 1 Original 🔲 2 F	State Court Appellate Court	Reopened another district (specify)	Appeal to District Multidistrict
VI. CAUSE OF ACT	Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under, which you a 28 U.S.C. Section 1332(a)(1)  Brief description of cause: Breach of Contract, Declaratory	re filing (Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless o	
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:	O CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION	DEMAND \$ CHECK	YES only if demanded in complaint:  DEMAND:
VIII. RELATED CAS		DOCKET NUI	
DATE 12/30/10	SIGNATURE OF PA	HORNES OKRESSED	DEC 3 0 2010
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY  RECEIPT #	AMOUNT APPLYING IFP	JUDGE	MAG. JUDGE

# Case 2:10-cv-07614-RAED Squment 1:5Filed 12/30/10 Page 2 of 16

APPENDIX I

Address of Philintiff: 1351 Atwood Ave., Johnston, Rhode Island (	10 7614 02919
Address of Defendant: 436 Walnut St., Philadelphia, Pennsylvania	19106 ,
Place of Accident, Incident or Transaction: Refusal to honor terms of re	g .
	For Additional Spacej
Does this civil action involve a nongovernmental corporate party with any parent corpora	
(Attach two copies of the Disclosure Statement Form in accordance with Fed.R.Civ	P. 7.1(a)) Yes \(\mathbb{N}\) No□
Does this case involve multidistrict litigation possibilities?  RELATED CASE, IF ANY:	Yes 🗆 📈
Case Number:Judge	Date Terminated:
Civil cases are deemed related when yes is answered to any of the following question	S:
1. Is this case related to property included in an earlier numbered suit pending or with	tin one year previously terminated action in this court?
	Yes□ No 🎗
2. Does this case involve the same issue of fact or grow out of the same transaction a action in this court?	s a prior suit pending or within one year previously terminated  Yes□ No   No   No   No   No   No   No   No
3. Does this case involve the validity or infringement of a patent already in suit or an terminated action in this court?	y earlier numbered case pending or within one year previously  Yes No  No  No
CIVIL: (Place in ONE CATEGORY ONLY)	$\sim$
A. Federal Quastion Cases:  1. D Indemnity Contract, Marine Contract, and All Other Contracts	B. Diversity Jurisdiction Cases:
2. D FELA	1. M Insurance Contract and Other Contracts
3. Dones Act-Personal Injury	<ol> <li>Airplane Personal Injury</li> <li>Assault, Defamation</li> </ol>
4. Antitrust	<ul> <li>3.   Assault, Defamation</li> <li>4.   Marine Personal Injury</li> </ul>
5. D Patent	5. Motor Vehicle Personal Injury
6.   Labor-Management Relations	6. Other Personal Injury (Please specify)
7. Civil Rights	7. Products Liability
8.  Habeas Compus	8. Products Liability — Asbestos
9. Securities Act(s) Cases	9. All other Diversity Cases
10. D Social Security Review Cases	(Please specify)
11.  All other Federal Question Cases (Please specify)	
AND ARBITRATION C	ERTIFICATION
(Check appropri	
Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 53.2, Section 3(c)(2), that to the best of my knexceet the sum of \$150,000.00 exclusive of interest and costs;	
Relief other than monetary damages is sought.	DEC 3 0
DATE 12/30/10 / Sella full	80206
Attempty at Law	Attorney I.D.#
NOTE: A trial de novo will be a trial by jury only	<u> </u>
Exertify that, to my knowledge, the within case is not related to any case upw peodi except as noted above.	ng or within one year previously terminated action in this court
DATE: 12/30/10	80206
A software the second	Afromey I.D.#

Case 2:10-cv-07614-RB Document 1 Filed 12/30/10 Page 3 of 16

### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

#### CASE MANAGEMENT TRACK DESIGNATION FORM

<b>APPALA</b>	<b>CHIAN</b>	INSUR.	ANCE	COMPANY,

v.

CIVIL ACTION

7614

INSURANCE COMPANY OF NORTH AMERICA,

: NO.

In accordance with the Civil Justice Expense and Delay Reduction Plan of this court, counsel for plaintiff shall complete a Case Management Track Designation Form in all civil cases at the time of filing the complaint and serve a copy on all defendants. (See § 1:03 of the plan set forth on the reverse side of this form.) In the event that a defendant does not agree with the plaintiff regarding said designation, that defendant shall, with its first appearance, submit to the clerk of court and serve on the plaintiff and all other parties, a Case Management Track Designation Form specifying the track to which that defendant believes the case should be assigned.

#### SELECT ONE OF THE FOLLOWING CASE MANAGEMENT TRACKS:

				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
7 3	TY 1 (7)	~ 1 1 1 A	O TT O O O O O A A . 1	1 0 00 0 0 0	
101	Hohane Committee (	Cases brought under 2	2     C     X   J   J       thec	wah 8 2244	/ \
10	LITAUGAN CULUUN **** V	CASES DIOUYIU HIIGELZ:	3 U.3.V. 9 ZZ#1 HRU	111911 0 7.7 3 3	1 1

- (b) Social Security Cases requesting review of a decision of the Secretary of Health and Human Services denying plaintiff Social Security Benefits. ()
- (c) Arbitration Cases required to be designated for arbitration under Local Civil Rule 53.2. ( )
- (d) Asbestos Cases involving claims for personal injury or property damage from exposure to asbestos. ( )
- (e) Special Management Cases that do not fall into tracks (a) through (d) that are commonly referred to as complex and that need special or intense management by the court. (See reverse side of this form for a detailed explanation of special management cases.)
- (f) Standard Management Cases that do not fall into any one of the other tracks.

December 30, 2010

Date

rnev-at-law William F. McDevitt APPALACHIAN INS. CO. **Attorney for Plaintiff** 

215.587.1600

215.587.1699

wfmcdevitt@cpmy.com

Telephone

**FAX Number** 

E-Mail Address

(Civ. 660) 10/02

DEC 3 0 2010



## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

APPALACHIAN INSURANCE COMPANY,

10 . 7614

Plaintiff,

CIVIL ACTION NO.

v.

**COMPLAINT** 

INSURANCE COMPANY OF NORTH AMERICA,

Defendant.

Plaintiff, Appalachian Insurance Company ("Appalachian"), and for its Complaint against Defendant, Insurance Company of North America ("INA"), alleges as follows:

#### **PARTIES**

- 1. Appalachian is incorporated under the laws of the State of Rhode Island with its principal place of business located at 1301 Atwood Ave., Johnston, Rhode Island 02919.
- 2. INA is incorporated under the laws of the State of Pennsylvania with its principal place of business located at 436 Walnut St., Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19106.

#### **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

3. This Court has subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1332(a)(1) because the amount in controversy exceeds \$75,000 exclusive of interest and costs and because there is complete diversity of citizenship in that Appalachian is a Rhode Island corporation with its principal place of business in Rhode Island and INA is a Pennsylvania corporation with its principal place of business in Pennsylvania.



- 4. This Court has personal jurisdiction over INA because it is a Pennsylvania corporation with its principal place of business in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.
- 5. Venue is proper in this Court because INA's principal place of business is located in this district and a substantial part of the events giving rise to this action occurred in this district. 28 U.S.C. § 1391(a).

#### NATURE OF THE ACTION

- 6. This action arises out of and seeks damages and other relief in connection with INA's breach of a reinsurance contract.
- 7. In a reinsurance contract, a reinsurer agrees to indemnify the reinsured against all or part of the loss that the reinsured may sustain under an insurance policy or policies that the reinsured company has issued, in exchange for a portion of the premium paid to the reinsured for the insurance policies.
- 8. A "facultative" reinsurance contract reinsures a specific insurance policy or risk, as opposed to "treaty" reinsurance, which reinsures multiple insurance policies or an entire book of business written by the reinsured.

#### THE CERTIFICATE OF FACULTATIVE REINSURANCE

- 9. For the period April 1, 1972 to April 1, 1975, Appalachian entered into a facultative reinsurance contract with INA, Certificate Number FRC 00585 ("Facultative Certificate"), pursuant to which INA agreed to reinsure an excess umbrella liability policy, Number 71074, that Appalachian issued to Union Carbide Corporation ("Union Carbide Policy"). A true and correct copy of the Facultative Certificate is attached hereto as Exhibit A.
- 10. Under the Facultative Certificate, INA agreed to reimburse Appalachian for certain amounts that Appalachian incurred in connection with the Union Carbide Policy.

- 11. The Facultative Certificate provided that INA's liability "shall follow that of [Appalachian] and ... shall be subject in all respects to all the terms and conditions of [Appalachian's] policy. . . . " Id., p. 2 at ¶ A.
- 12. The Facultative Certificate also contains "follow the settlements" language which provides that "[a]ll claims involving this reinsurance, when settled by [Appalachian], shall be binding on [INA]." *Id.*, p. 2 at ¶ C.

### THE UNDERLYING ASBESTOS CLAIMS AND APPALACHIAN'S LOSS PAYMENTS

- 13. After the Facultative Certificate was executed, Union Carbide was named as a defendant in many asbestos products personal injury claims and lawsuits. Union Carbide tendered these claims and lawsuits to its insurers, including Appalachian, for defense and indemnity.
- 14. Appalachian was named as a party in a lawsuit captioned *Union Carbide Corp. v.*Affiliated FM Insurance Co., et al., Index No. 600804-04, Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of New York. In that lawsuit, Union Carbide alleged that its insurers, including Appalachian, were obligated to defend and indemnify it in connection with the underlying asbestos claims and lawsuits.
- 15. On or around September 10, 2008, Appalachian and Union Carbide entered into a confidential settlement agreement resolving Union Carbide's claims asserted in the above-referenced insurance coverage lawsuit. Pursuant to this settlement agreement, Appalachian agreed to make certain payments to Union Carbide, including payments under the Union Carbide Policy. Appalachian's decision to settle Union Carbide's insurance coverage claims was undertaken after a good faith, reasonable, and business-like assessment of Appalachian's duties under the Union Carbide Policy and possible coverage defenses.

#### APPALACHIAN'S REINSURANCE BILLING TO INA

- 16. Subsequent to earlier reporting, Appalachian issued a billing, including certain proofs of loss, to INA pursuant to the Facultative Certificate on or around July 29, 2010. These proofs of loss exceed \$2 million.
- 17. The Facultative Certificate provides that "[p]ayment of its proportion of loss and expense paid by the [Appalachian] will be made by [INA] promptly following receipt of proof of loss." Exhibit A, p. 2 at ¶ D.
  - 18. INA has not paid Appalachian's billings.

### COUNT ONE Breach of Contract

- 19. Appalachian repeats and incorporates herein by reference the allegations contained in the foregoing paragraphs 1-18 as if fully set forth herein.
- 20. Appalachian has fully performed its obligations under the Facultative Certificate and has properly billed INA for amounts due thereunder.
- 21. In breach of the Facultative Certificate and in violation of its duty of utmost good faith to Appalachian, INA has refused to pay Appalachian's billings.
- 22. INA's failure to pay Appalachian's billings have damaged Appalachian.

  WHEREFORE, Appalachian demands that judgment be entered in its favor and against

  INA as follows:
  - (a) Awarding Appalachian money damages plus interest with respect to outstanding billings;
  - (b) For attorneys' fees, interest and costs of suit; and
  - (c) Such other relief the Court deems appropriate.

## COUNT TWO Declaratory Relief

- 23. Appalachian repeats and incorporates herein by reference the allegations contained in the foregoing paragraphs 1-18 as if fully set forth herein.
- 24. Under the settlement agreement, Appalachian will make additional future payments to Union Carbide under the Union Carbide Policy. Appalachian anticipates billing appropriate portions of these future payments to INA under the Facultative Certificate.
- 25. An actual controversy exists with respect to the parties' rights under the Facultative Certificate, including but not limited to, the obligations of INA to pay past, current and future billings in a timely manner.
- 26. Appalachian is entitled to a declaration of its rights under the Facultative Certificate.

WHEREFORE, Appalachian demands that judgment be entered in its favor and against INA as follows:

- (a) Declaring that INA is obligated to pay past, current and future billings from Appalachian regarding the Union Carbide Policy in a timely manner;
- (b) Awarding Appalachian attorneys' fees, interest and costs of suit; and
- (c) Awarding Appalachian such other relief the Court deems appropriate.

Respectfully submitted,

CHRISTIE, PABARUE, MORTENSEN and

YOUNG, AProfessional Corporation

Вv:

HAMES W. CHRISTIE

wchristie@cpmy.com

WILLIAM F. McDEVITT wfmcdevitt@cpmy.com

1880 JFK Boulevard, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 (215) 587-1600

Attorneys for Plaintiff, Appalachian Insurance Company

DATED: December 30, 2010

Of Counsel

Robert J. Bates, Jr.
Bates Carey Nicolaides LLP
191 N. Wacker Drive, Suite 2400
Chicago, Illinois 60606
(312) 762-3100

**EXHIBIT A** 

PRE 00585

Philadelphia, Pennsylvania



(hereing salled, the Rajasurer)

In consideration of the payment of the premium, and subject to the terms, conditions and limits of liability set forth	, harald, and in t	the Declaration made a
part has gol, the ReinsJAFAGGEFAAGO reinsure the coding company named in the Declarations (herein collect the C	Company Practice	Section His Company Ale
policy as fellows:	!	

RECEIVED

Appalachian Insurance Company o/o New Providence Corporation

REINSURING AGREEMENTS AND COMMITTONISSEL ENTUT COLL Providence, Rhode Island 02904 UU 27 19/2

> Mr. Mal Poignand ATTENTION

The Company warrants to retein for its own eccount or that of its tresty reinsurer (s) the amount of liability specified in Item 3 of the Daclarations, unless otherwise duclared to the Rolesurer, and the liability of the Re-

D. Payment of its proportion of loss and exponse paid by the Company will be made by the Reinsurer to the Company premptly following receipt of

proof of lass. ERNIE OF WELLES

insurer specified in Item 4 of sala Dictardions shall follow that of the Union Carbide Corporation the supposition of the formal state of the Company's policy except the Remsure will like the terms and the terms and the terms and the terms and the terms are the company with its project of the c

such as may purport to medic a direct abligation cathe Reinsurer to the ong. I TOTO THE END TO SERVE SERVED AND THE PROPERTY mede by the nal insured. The Company shall furnish the Reinsurer with e.copy of his policy of Company, less the actual cost (excluding Company has been sent the second of the control of the company shall be the control of the co nal insured. The Company shall furnish the Reinsurer with e-copy of 113 petitor [Perises] of philosophic with reinsurage policy perises of the and all endorsements thereto which in any manage affect that totalle plant reinsurance afforded by this Conflicate to on the excess of loss bests, released

occurrance or accident which appears likely to Involve this reinsurance and while the Religiumer door not undertake to have these ar defend claims or suits it shall nevertheless have the right and be given the opportunity to associate with the Company and its representatives at its own expense in the defense and control of eny claim, suit or proceeding involving this reinsurance. with the fell cooperation of the Company.

The Company will be liable for all texas on premiums coded to the INROILUTE HARPINITA ARA. 000, 22 Excess occ. -agg. part of Umbreils 920,000,000 CSL each Liability in the event of insulyancy of the Company, the terms of this Certificate are amended to appropriet that the propriet of any state of the United States having flyrighigh by the extent that such reinsurance as is afforded herounder mar barrediled iphter Compens as en admitted esset or deduction from liability, it being understood that cobject to such amendment, the Reinsufer may applifying of agreement provision of any such statute applicable. Hability, which in

C. All claims involving this roinsurance, when lettled by the Company, shall be binding on the Reinsurer, which, shall be bound to pay its proportion of such seltlements, and in addition thereto, in the ratio that the Reinsurer's loss payment beers to the Company's gross loss payment, with respect ta husians accorded on an expose of loss basis and in the ration that the Par insurer's limit of liability boors to the Company's gross limit of liability with E respect to busing accepted on a pro rata besit, its proportion of expanses, on the company selectes and office expanses, incurred by the Company

Constitute automatic candilation of the Office of the livery also be concelled on a pro rate gailes exites esting radio at at guilding of office (affect of the wites when, not less than Thirty [30] adays the thirty and sent and the whon the test than Thirty [30] adays the thirty and the test than the test t

in the investigation and settlement of claims or suits and with the prior MUNISTER TO THE COURT OF THE COURT

1. The terms of this Certificate shall not be waived at changed except 1.4ANR STADISTRES BINT ROT RESIDENT TROS BRY by andersoment issued to form a part before

	***************************************		ministra in becale	ien or cont. Di	direct solution 18	TAULD IO SOUTH O	beil natent a	secores by 6 ¢	Inta Samountenc
CYNAME IS				10000		ling stellinger			
387.50 /				•					,
425,00 C	turess id	, 2. Y hereof, the	INSURANCE CO	PMPANY OF NOT the seme shall no	RTH AMERICA	has caused b	hic Reinsurance	Certificate t	ව විල ක්සුරුලේ
And the same of the same of				A why 1 - 1-1-16 1 16 2 man		and the second second	er unless count	**************************************	THE PARTY OF THE P
representativ	i of the Reast	\$1,000 \$1,000	um Corasa s	or reinsuranci ()	\$5,812.5	OWEI IN I		,	AUDIT PERIQD
72	eptembel	· /1	d <b>4</b> 8	40	novi venue	ש איניים	le read		
1	- A large to had been	TOXOL TO	4	THE BL				<b>₹</b> -7€\$	ия жаз Гичес Т

President

.A.B.U HI STA SIBS D

CERTIFI E OF FACULTATIVE REINSURANCE ISSUED BY



#### INSURANCE COMPANY OF NORTH AMERICA 1600 Arch Street Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19101

### DECLARATIONS

CEDING	COMPANY	AND	ADDRESS
--------	---------	-----	---------

INTERMEDIARY

00585

Appalachian Insurance Company
c/o New Providence Corporation
1500 Turks Head Building
Providence, Rhode Island 02904
NTION Mr. Mal Poignand

RECEIVED

OCT 2 7 1972

L.	. Mai roighanu	:	N. P. C.	•
AME OF INSURED Union Car	bide Corporation	STATE	RENEWAL OF CERTIFICATE NO. FRC REPLACES CERTIFICATE NO.	
270 Park	Avenue New York, New	York 10017	FRC	
71074) and	71099 April 1	, 1972 to April 1,	1975	
there of Theurance	POLICY LIBITE THE AVELICATION	COMPANY ABJERTION	REINBURANCE ACCEPTED	TEM 8 SASIS OF ACCEPTANCE
Excess Umbrella Liability	\$2,000,000 CSL each occagg. part of \$20,000,000 CSL each occagg. excess of \$20,000,000 CSL Umbrella Liability excluding marine, \$15,000,000 CSL including marine liability, which in turn is excess of underlying insurance and/or \$500,000 SIR.		\$2,000,000 CSL each occagg. part of \$20,000,000 CSL each occagg.	Contrib- uting Excess
HE TERM OF THIS CERTIFI NLESS TERMINATED BY CA HALL BE FROM THE		11 ,972 TO THE	1st DAY OF A	pril
THE NE	T PREMIUM FOR THIS CERTIFICATE S	SHALL BE \$ 5,812.50	FIXED CHARGE	EPOSIT PREMIUM
PREMIUM BARI	METIMAT	ET EXPOSURE	CANADIAN: U.S.A.:	\$ 387.50 5,425.00 \$ 5,812.50
UDIT PERIOD	MINIMUM PREMIUS - \$5,812	m for reinsurance period .50	\$1,000	RTIFICATE
OUNTERSIGNED AT	Philadelphia, Pennsylv	ANIA THE 6	Th DAY OF Septemb	er 19 7
2612 PTO IN U.S.A. 5-72		BY 1. 18. 1	Viznaant Authorized Signature	



# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

APPALACHIAN INSURANCE COMPANY,

10 27614

Plaintiff,

CÎVIL ACTION NO.

INSURANCE COMPANY OF NORTH AMERICA,

Defendant.

#### PLAINTIFF'S RULE 7.1 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 7.1, Plaintiff Appalachian Insurance Company ("Appalachian") submits the following statement:

- 1. Appalachian Insurance Company is a wholly owned subsidiary of FMIC Holdings, Inc.
- 2. FMIC Holdings, Inc. is a wholly owned subsidiary of Factory Mutual Insurance Company.

CHRISTIE, PABARUE, MORTENSEN and YOUNG, A Professional Corporation

By:

JAMES W. CHRISTIE

jwchristie@cpmy.com WILLIAM F. McDEVITT

wfmcdevitt@cpmy.com

1880 JFK Boulevard, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor

Philadelphia, PA 19103

(215) 587-1600

DATED: December 30, 2010

Of Counsel

Robert J. Bates, Jr.
Bates Carey Nicolaides LLP
191 N. Wacker Drive, Suite 2400
Chicago, Illinois 60606
(312) 762-3100

372135